Resource Reviews: China Law Translate
Part of series of reviews prepared by the Electronic Research Interest Group

Alex Zhang

INTRODUCTION
Launched in 2013, operated under a crowdsourcing model, China Law Translate\(^1\) has become one of the frequently used translation tools for Chinese Law researchers who are non-native speakers and would like to access English translations with no fee incurred.

Legal researchers who need to rely on an English translation of Chinese sources, such as legislation, rules and regulations, and cases, should keep a few caveats in mind before relying on any translations. First, English translation, even provided by an official government entity, is never going to be an official legal source in China, as the official language in China -- except for Hong Kong and Macao -- is Chinese. Primary legal texts in vernacular will always trump translated texts. Second, in terms of translation quality, nothing is perfect. However, there are a few areas that a user should check carefully for translation quality. First, the author: a good English translation of primary legal sources usually requires the translator to be proficient in both English and Chinese and also be trained to understand both the differences (on both big and smaller scales) between the legal system of the source country/jurisdiction and receptor country/jurisdiction. If possible, users should spend some time checking the reputation, experience, and expertise of a translator author. Second, in regards to the legal text itself, Deborah Cao, in her well-known work, Translating Law\(^2\), reminds us that "the legal status and communicative purposes in the Source Language (SL) texts are not automatically transferred or carried over to the Target Language (TL) texts."\(^3\) Effective transfer relies not only on the expertise and knowledge of the translator but also on the user’s ability to identify areas that may create unique obstacles for the effective transfer. For example, Cao identified three significant sources of difficulty in legal translations as "the legal, linguistic and cultural complications."\(^4\) Finally, the nature of the legal texts also matters: the nature and legal force of each type of legal text varies dramatically among diverse legal systems, the process and procedure by which legal texts are produced, organized, and updated can also be very different.

With all these in mind, let us take a close look at China Law Translator, more specifically in the following aspects:

HOW WELL-KNOWN IS THE SOURCE?
China Law Translator is a relatively new source, launched in 2013. However, it has become increasingly popular, mostly because it has been quite successful in filling a gap in the area of English translations of primary sources of Chinese law. The founders of the website are Jeremy Daum and Changhao Wei, both with extensive experience in practicing or researching law in China, as the official language in China -- except for Hong Kong and Macao -- is Chinese. Primary legal texts in vernacular will always trump translated texts. Second, in terms of translation quality, nothing is perfect. However, there are a few areas that a user should check carefully for translation quality. First, the author: a good English translation of primary legal sources usually requires the translator to be proficient in both English and Chinese and also be trained to understand both the differences (on both big and smaller scales) between the legal system of the source country/jurisdiction and receptor country/jurisdiction. If possible, users should spend some time checking the reputation, experience, and expertise of a translator author. Second, in regards to the legal text itself, Deborah Cao, in her well-known work, Translating Law, reminds us that "the legal status and communicative purposes in the Source Language (SL) texts are not automatically transferred or carried over to the

---

1. https://www.chinalawtranslate.com
3. Id. at 7.

continued on page 3
Loren Turner

Wow. According to the calendar, it’s been three months since my last newsletter column. It feels like a lifetime ago. The COVID-19 virus, still spreading throughout our communities, forced us to quarantine in our homes, redesign our courses, and transition to virtual reference/research services. Few of us know what to expect in the coming days and months. In this stressful, unsettling time, I encourage you to reach out to me and/or your friends and colleagues here in our SIS whenever you are having one of those increasingly common days when your thoughts scatter and you feel unproductive, anxious, and overwhelmed. We can help you with that faculty project or that reference question or that course module. It’s what we do.

AALL ANNUAL MEETING AND RELATED EVENTS
I wish I could share, as is typical in this May issue of our Newsletter, details about our Annual Meeting. Unfortunately, I can only share what I know, which isn’t much. I know that AALL canceled the 2020 Annual Meeting in New Orleans and is planning to provide a virtual alternative conference to occur on July 13-17. I know that AALL’s virtual conference will not include the FCIL preconference workshop on civil law and legal systems that we created and announced in the February issue of our Newsletter. I am currently working with our Education Committee, our Continuing Education Committee, and, of course, the workshop’s panelists, to offer some of the workshop modules as a webinar series, instead. We will announce the details and date(s) of that webinar series soon and, unlike the in-person workshop, the webinar will be free and open to anyone around the world. As for our SIS meetings that we usually host during the AALL annual meeting – our business meeting, our Committee meetings, and our Interest Group meetings – stay tuned. Once AALL releases a conference program, I’ll know whether there are times during the conference when we can schedule our SIS events. If AALL does not provide a time for us to host our SIS meetings during the conference, we will schedule our meetings outside of the conference dates. Regardless, we will meet (virtually) and I will work closely with the Executive Committee as well as the Chairs of our Committees and Interest Groups to schedule those meetings and to keep you informed.

FCIL-SIS AWARDS
This year, the Executive Committee has made some changes to the number of awards we will distribute and the methods we will use to publicize and distribute them. In addition to our traditional three FCIL-SIS awards (Daniel L. Wade Outstanding Service Award; Reynolds/Flores Publication Award, and the Spirit Awards), we have created three new awards to celebrate the Blog Post of the Year, the Newsletter Article of the Year, and the Committee/Interest Group Project of the Year. The FCIL-SIS members who will receive these awards will be announced, for the first time, in the AALL Awards Brochure, giving our members the national recognition they deserve. Also, because we cannot meet in person this year, we will ship the physical awards to the recipients, and we hope to follow up with images of the award recipients with the physical token of our appreciation during our virtual business meeting and/or via our FCIL-SIS publications. Congratulations in advance to all of our award recipients and thank you to Dennis Sears for helping us select and acquire meaningful physical symbols of our admiration and appreciation.

FCIL-SIS ELECTIONS
Congratulations to Hunter Whaley! Hunter was elected to serve as the Vice-Chair/Chair-Elect of the FCIL-SIS. His term will begin in July. Thank you, Hunter, for agreeing to serve in this important leadership role! Also, thank you Jennifer Allison, our FCIL-SIS Secretary/Treasurer, for organ-
tions are free and provided by volunteers, the cost of running such a website may be moderate.

**HOW ACCESSIBLE IS IT?**
The website is accessible in terms that it has a clear organizational structure of the materials available on the website by subject matter. Each article is also assigned tags or keywords, which allows users to find sources on similar matters easily. The glossary list helps maintain uniformity across the website. It is free and can be accessed anywhere in the world via the internet. It is hard to tell whether the website is user-friendly for users with disabilities.

**HOW COMPREHENSIVE & AUTHORITATIVE IS IT, IN TERMS OF ITS CONTENTS?**
The website is not comprehensive in terms that it certainly does not cover all major legal documents in all main areas of Chinese law. However, it does provide information that other (free) websites or resources do not currently offer. For example, it offers English translations of secondary legal materials in China, such as legislative and regulatory drafts, guidance materials from official agencies, legal news (auto-fetched from Reddit), in addition to primary laws, regulations, measures from both national and sub-national levels and guiding cases from China’s Supreme People’s Court and China’s Supreme People’s Procuratorate. Furthermore, although the primary goal is to provide reliable English translations, the website can be used as a source for finding these legal documents and materials in Chinese.

**HOW EASY-TO-USE (USER-FRIENDLY) IS IT?**
The website is, generally speaking, easy to use and very intuitive. The search bar functions well. The option to leave comments and to rate a piece of translation makes it interactive and easy to receive timely feedback. However, it is not equipped with advanced features that we would expect from commercial databases such as Lexis or Westlaw.

**HOW USEFUL IS IT IN TERMS OF ITS ABILITY TO ANSWER BOTH COMMON AND RARE (DIFFICULT-TO-FIND) QUESTIONS?**
The website does a great job serving the primary goal of providing timely English translations of Chinese legal materials. As a result, although it may not provide a straightforward answer to a legal question, it does provide access to primary sources that can be studied and interpreted to answer practical or scholarly legal questions.

**HOW CURRENT (UP-TO-DATE) IS IT?**
The website is current in the sense that it does provide access to legal materials (as well as English translations) if available in a quick fashion. For example, the most recent post of the website provides the full text in Chinese as well as an English translation of China's Supreme People's Court's guiding opinion on Covid-19 related to Civil Disputes. The original Chinese guidance was issued on April 16, 2020, and the translation became available on April 20, 2020.5 It is not current in terms that (1) there are still many documents with no English translation, and (2) the website does not have a way to provide currency status of primary source material. For example, the website provides a full text in Chinese of China's 2012 Mental Health Law with no English translation.6 Furthermore, the Mental Health Law of China was amended in 2018, which is not indicated on the website. This can be misleading and dangerous when it comes to primary legal texts research.7

Overall, it is a cost-effective resource with reasonably high-quality content. Just as when using any resources for legal research, especially foreign legal research, researchers should proceed with caution.

---

From the Chair  
continued from page 2

izing and facilitating our election this year, and thank you Gabriela Femenia, Chair of our Nomination Committee, for putting Hunter’s name forward as a candidate.

FCIL-SIS VOLUNTEER SURVEY & INCOMING CHAIRS
Thank you to everyone who completed the FCIL-SIS Volunteer Survey. We received a great response in these pandemic times! If you missed the survey, there is still time to volunteer. Please do not hesitate to reach out to me if you would like to join one of our Committees or Interest Groups! We would love to have you.

Also, I am happy to announce that, in July, Marcelo Rodríguez will join Jessica Pierucci as the new co-Chair of the Publicity Committee. Marcelo will be replacing Alyson Drake, whose vision and dedication has helped our DipLawMatic Dialogues blog gain a regular and international readership. Thank you, Alyson, and no pressure, Marcelo!

Additionally, Alex Zhang will become the new Chair of the International Visits Committee. Alex will be replacing Hunter Whaley, who is rotating off to join the FCIL-SIS executive committee as Vice-Chair/Chair-Elect. Thank you Alex and Hunter!

REMEMBERING DAN L. WADE
As we announced via our listserv at the end of this terrible month of May, our friend, colleague, and mentor, Dan Wade, passed away after a long battle with kidney disease and a recent struggle with heart failure. Dan was a founding member of the FCIL-SIS and a beloved leader in our community. We will be planning myriad ways to honor him and his legacy, including a tribute to him in this Newsletter in the coming months.

THANK YOU
This is my last column to you as Chair of the FCIL-SIS and I am so grateful to you for your support this year. It has been, shall we say, quite an experience! I want to give special recognition to the executive committee members: Susan Gualtier, Jennifer Allison, and Catherine Deane for their invaluable support and collaboration this year. Also, thank you to all of our members who agreed to host and facilitate webinars this year so that we can continue to provide substantive content to our SIS members in the absence of a traditional annual meeting: Jennifer Allison, Yemisi Dina, Caitlin Hunter, Janet Kearney, Marylin Raish, Marcelo Rodríguez, Alison Shea, and Alex Zhang. Thank you to Melissa Abernathy and Carmen Valero for connecting us through the Newsletter, and thank you to all of you for your patience and fortitude this year. I cannot express how grateful I am for the faith and support you’ve offered and I hope that, over the course of my future career, I can show you how much it has meant to me.

Webinar: Law Librarians Combatting Infodemic during the COVID-19 Pandemic

Caitlin Hunter

As the legal response to COVID-19 constantly evolves, it can be difficult to keep track of the rapidly shifting legal landscape.

In two paired webinars on June 18, 2020, law librarians will provide an overview of legal responses to COVID-19 worldwide, introduce tools for tracking the international legal response, and explain how to evaluate sources of information in connection with this crisis.

At 11 am US/Central, Alex Zhang (Washington & Lee), Alison Shea (Cornell), Yemisi Dina (Osgoode Hall Law School, York University), and Mariya Badeva-Bright (Laws.Africa) will update viewers on COVID-19 responses in Asia, Europe, and Africa, highlighting especially interesting responses that you may have missed and resources for learning more.

At 2 pm US/Central, Marcelo Rodríguez (US Courts for the 2nd Circuit), Dr. Michele A. L. Villagran (San José State University), and Victoria De La Torre (AALL Latino Caucus Chair) will introduce viewers to Law Librarians Monitoring COVID-19, their project tracking COVID-19 in Latin America and the Caribbean, and provide updates on COVID-19 responses in the Americas.

Please register now for the Law Librarians Combatting Infodemic during the COVID-19 Pandemic webinars on June 18 at 11 am and 2 pm US/Central.
Resource Reviews: HUDOC

Part of series of reviews prepared by the Electronic Research Interest Group

Erin Gow

**HOW WELL-KNOWN IS THE SOURCE?**
HUDOC is the European Court of Human Rights’ free online database of case law. It is widely used across Europe and by researchers interested in human rights law.

**HOW ACCESSIBLE IS IT?**
HUDOC is freely available online at https://hudoc.echr.coe.int/eng#%20. It is currently searchable in six languages, with documents available in many more, which makes this database especially accessible to researchers whose first language is not English.

**HOW AUTHORITATIVE IS IT?**
HUDOC is the official database provided by the European Court of Human Rights, and hosts the official version of all judgments, advisory opinions, and decisions since the conclusion of the print series of Reports of Judgments and Decisions in 2016. Researchers who require older judgments as published in the Reports can find them on the Court’s website at https://www.echr.coe.int/Pages/home.aspx?p=caselaw/reports&c=.

**HOW COMPREHENSIVE IS IT, IN TERMS OF ITS CONTENTS?**
The scope of the HUDOC database is necessarily limited exclusively to the European Court of Human Rights, but it contains extremely deep and thorough collections of materials from that body. The database includes case-law from the Court in the form of judgments and decisions, communicated cases, advisory opinions, and legal summaries, the European Commission of Human Rights decisions and reports, and the Committee of Ministers resolutions.

**HOW EASY-TO-USE (USER-FRIENDLY) IS IT?**
Despite being well known, HUDOC is not always well-understood. The database is extremely large and unwieldy, with a search mechanism that requires a larger degree of precision than many of the subscription databases researchers may be used to working with. The default search on the HUDOC homepage is also set to search only a subset of the materials, and although a complete search is easy to achieve by ticking a few boxes, the non-intuitive nature of the database can make it confusing for users.

**HOW USEFUL IS IT IN TERMS OF ITS ABILITY TO ANSWER BOTH COMMON AND RARE (DIFFICULT-TO-FIND) QUESTIONS?**
HUDOC is extremely useful in answering any questions related to finding primary source materials related to European Court of Human Rights cases.

**HOW CURRENT (UP-TO-DATE) IS IT?**
The database is regularly updated and often provides the first point of access to judgments from the European Court of Human Rights.

---

**Submissions For Next Issue**

*FCIL Newsletter* is looking for submissions for our next issue.

**ARTICLES**
Conference reports, library visits, exhibit descriptions, resource reviews, member news, etc. Open call for authors.

**SUBMISSION DEADLINE**
October 1, 2020

**QUESTIONS?**
Contact Melissa Abernathy.

---

**Member Publications**

Have you recently published an article or blog post? We would love to highlight it in our Recent Member Publications.

Send your information to Jingwei Zhang for the next issue.
FCIL-SIS Member Recent Publications Roundup

Our SIS is fortunate to include in its ranks exceptionally talented and enthusiastic writers. With this feature, we are happy to spread the word of their recent publications.

SPECTRUM

JOURNAL ARTICLES
Legal Reference Services Quarterly

BLOG POSTS
IALL Blog
- David Isom, *Reminiscence of Sydney*
- Heather Casey, *COVID-19 and its international response*

DipLawMatic Dialogues
- Amy Flick, *From the Reference Desk: Starting with a Secondary Source*
- Rachel Green, *IALL 2019 Recap: Mary Crock, Refugee Law in Australia: The Protection of Migrant Children*
- Janet Kearney, *New FCIL Librarian Series: Resisting the Urge to Do It All*
- Yasmin Morais, *Updates on COVID-19 in Latin America and the Caribbean: Caribbean Community (CARICOM), and Organization of Eastern Caribbean States (OECS)*
- Lucie Olejnikova, *GlobaLex March/April 2020 Issue is Live*
- Lucie Olejnikova, *GlobaLex January/February 2020 Issue is Live*
- Jonathan Pratter, *From the Reference Desk: On Having to Say No*
- Jonathan Pratter, *From the Reference Desk: Is It a Good Idea to Learn More Than One Foreign Language?*
- Jonathan Pratter, *From the Reference Desk: Who Are the Most Highly Qualified Publicists?*
- Marcelo Rodriguez, *Updates on COVID-19 in Latin America and the Caribbean: Bolivia, Paraguay, Peru*

NEWSLETTER ARTICLES
ALL-SIS Newsletter
- Malinda Muller and Elaine Pham, *AALL2Go Offers Recordings of Educational and Conference Programs*
- Meredith Capps, *Using ‘Backwards Design’ to Update Your IL Research Curriculum*

Government Law Libraries SIS Newsletter
- Malinda Muller, *Book Reviews*

Technical Services SIS Newsletter – Technical Service Law Librarian
- Aaron Wolfe Kuperman, *Last Post*
- George Prager, *Environmental Law Reclassification 2020*

FCIL Newsletter

*FCIL Newsletter* is a publication of the Foreign, Comparative, and International Law Special Interest Section of the American Association of Law Libraries. It is published in February, May, and October of each year. Current and past issues of *FCIL Newsletter* are available on our website. We welcome submissions. Contact us for more information.

EDITOR
Melissa Abernathy
mabernathy@sandiego.edu
University of San Diego

COPY EDITOR
Carmen Valero
carmen.valero@dentons.com
Dentons US LLP

FCIL-SIS EXECUTIVE BOARD 2019-2020

CHAIR
Loren Turner

VICE CHAIR/CHAIR-ELECT
Susan Gualtier

SECRETARY/TREASURER
Jennifer Allison

PAST CHAIR
Catherine Deane