Measuring Competence

The Report of the American Association of Law Libraries
Special Committee to Develop Performance Measurements for Law Librarians
INTRODUCTION

"What really matters is what you do with what you have." Shirley Lord

"...people will never know how long it takes you to do something. They will only know how well it is done." Nancy Hanks

Work is what defines us as human beings and creates our self image. To most of us the work environment has become like a second home. Some spend more hours in the workplace than ever before, and many form lasting relationships with their co-workers; colleagues and supervisors alike. In order to be fairly evaluated by our supervisors, it’s important that we do the best we can with our innate talents and abilities. If we do, our efforts will be evaluated on how well we did, not who we are. If we don’t do our best, or our supervisors don’t have very good measuring sticks by which to evaluate our efforts, then we become frustrated and our self-image and sometimes our work suffers.

The Special Committee on Developing Performance Measures was appointed by AALL President Barbara Bintliff in 2001 to explore performance measures that can be adapted for use by law librarians and their employers in the various law library settings. The Special Committee was charged to "develop universal performance measures that can be used for self-assessment by individual librarians or for performance evaluation of law librarians by employers". The committee was also directed to base their work on the Competencies of Law Librarianship, approved by the Executive Board in April 2001, and to submit this final report to the Executive Board at the July 2003 meeting.

AALL recognizes that law librarians are called on to assume critical roles within their organizations. In order to be effective in new work environments, law librarians must develop their skills and abilities to meet new organizational challenges and needs. Law librarians once spent the majority of their time at work identifying, organizing, and maintaining information resources. They are now called on to serve in increasingly diverse organizational roles (see Beyond the Boundaries: the Report of the Special Committee on the Future of Law Libraries in the Digital Age.) as leaders and partners. Law librarians are called on to make key decisions and must likewise take responsibility for those decisions.

The Competencies of Law Librarianship formed the starting point of this committee's discussions. The Committee spent many hours discussing competence measures and evaluation devices such as differences between cognitive and emotional intelligence competencies, ways of measuring performance success in the workplace, and when an employee can be pushed on to the next step in her career.

This final product represents two questions that drove our work. What is competence? How do you validate competence in a meaningful way for all AALL constituencies?

COMMITTEE PROCESS

The group began their work by critically analyzing the Competencies of Law Librarianship and discerning the meaning behind them. To accomplish this, the Committee consulted with members of the PDC who were the originators of the document and analyzed the 2000 Annual Meeting open forum and PDC Listserv discussion on the topic of competencies.
After a series of discussions, consultation with outside experts, and some reliance on Anntoinette D. Lucia's and Richard Lepsinger's book, *The Art and Science of Competency Models*, Jossey-Bass (1999), we determined that the competencies needed to be broken down into more specific concepts that could be defined before they could be effectively measured. Our experts also told us that the Competencies of Law Librarianship document contained more than 300 competencies and qualities that could be measured. We decided to choose the 30-40 most critical competencies from the list that fit into five performance areas similar to those used by the AICPA: functional expertise, leadership, professional perspective, communication, and personal attributes/qualities.

After completing our preliminary work, we devised a survey and sent it to selected members of the Association to validate our ideas about which competencies are most critical to the success of librarians in our profession in any job capacity. The survey was announced to the membership in Orlando in an Orange Peel article and also in several emails sent through law-lib and other lists. (see Appendix, Survey Results)

Using the list of critical competencies, the Committee began further defining competencies and placed them in a workplace learning continuum by devising beginning, intermediate and advanced levels for each performance area. Most competencies build on each other and tend to be cumulative, so a learning continuum seemed the most effective way to organize our information. However, since each job in an organization is so unique, mastery at any given level must be determined by that organization and our measures are merely guidelines and suggestions for employers to consider. The workplace learning continuum we devised, set out below, can be used to help individuals discern their current skills levels so they can set future goals and can be used by employers as a broad evaluative guide:

**Basic:** Describes the level at which someone new to a skill or attribute should be performing. Often this law librarian will occupy an entry-level position in the organization. However, it may also describe a seasoned professional with limited exposure to this performance area.

**Intermediate:** Describes the level at which someone with detailed knowledge in an area should be performing. It is expected that this employee is capable of taking operational responsibility for an area. Often, this employee occupies a mid-level position within the organization and has supervisory responsibilities.

**Advanced:** Describes the level at which someone with mastery of a skill should be performing. Often this person is the highest-ranking law librarian in the organization. However, it may also describe a department head with specialized knowledge in a subject area. Additionally, because some competencies are so complex, they can only be performed by a senior law library staff member.

After defining these more specific levels of competence, we developed measurable elements for each. We then created "examples" or "indicators" of professional growth and development that could be measured and created a series of sample measurement devices that could be used for those indicators. Although our work is not comprehensive it is intended to give readers an idea of the types of indicators they might need to develop to fit their internal performance measurement instruments or something that will coordinate with those instruments.
MEASUREMENT CONCEPTS

Before an organization can measure competence it must first define it. To ensure performance quality, an organization must set specific expectations about the desired quality of the skill, service, or activity in advance of measuring it. These standards define the level of performance that an organization is willing to accept as representing performance quality. An organization must be aware that there can be differing acceptable levels of quality for different types of services. Additionally, the staff involved in setting performance levels must discuss and agree on what constitutes "quality" for a range of activities and performance. Once this happens, a range of measurement devices and techniques can be employed to assess whether the standard is met or not.

Measurement Devices and Techniques

When you can't be present to observe employee performance every moment, be sure that you set processes in place through which you can learn about how they're doing. These processes should be open, fair, and understood by everyone.

Possibilities for evaluating performance include:

- Peer assessment,
- Structured self-assessment
- Virtual reality (computerized simulations)
- Pre-/post-evaluation discussions followed by observations in the work environment.
- Critique the results/differences in behavior
- Assign an expert evaluator from inside or outside the organization to evaluate the employee's competence in a specific area.
- Evaluate the output and products of the employee's work using checklists or other agreed on feedback.
- Have routine one-on-one meetings with the employee and include discussions of performance.
- Periodically review and discuss the standards of performance for his or her job and your expectations with the employee.
- Have the employee write periodic reports and share them with you for discussion.
- Obtain written feedback from customers using surveys or other devises.
- Do brief check-ins or phone calls to follow up after a crisis or event that calls competencies into play.
- Perform routine spot checks of the employee during their work day.
- Ask for confidential evaluations of employee performance by peers (or direct reports of supervisors). This process should be clearly understood by everyone and applied fairly to all.
- Create opportunities for employee self-assessment followed by feedback.
- Create surveys, skills inventories, questionnaires, profiles, multi-rater instruments, portfolios satisfaction surveys, checklists, and employee created performance samples.
- Conduct interviews, create observation measures.
- Observe the employee and evaluate a variety of library related activities. Ensure librarians are in compliance with established measures and procedures. Note and document differences.
- diary techniques (job holders record what they do and how they do it, how long time spend on each task).
- Staff appraisal and Management by Objectives information
CRITICAL AREAS OF COMPETENCY FOR LAW LIBRARIANS

Since competence is learned behavior that helps people perform well in work situations, it will levels of competence will change as one rises through the ranks. Certain positions require specific competencies. However, within different types of law libraries, competencies attached to a specific job title may be entirely different. For example, ...

The Committee chose to divide competency areas into five distinct performance areas. Some of the competencies are cognitive and knowledge-based, while others are personal or social and reflect the emotional intelligence that employees bring to a workplace (see Working with Emotional Intelligence by Daniel Goleman, Bantam, 200?). Each Committee member chose one of the following areas to develop:

Functional Expertise

Mental Agility--Ability to deal with multiple issues and details; alert; possesses broad learning capacity; approach problems resourcefully and creatively; actively pursues related information

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

Beginning Level: A Beginning employee should be able to manage multiple pieces or sources of information effectively, be able to concentrate totally on what s/he is doing, seeing, reading, hearing, learning, feeling, observing or experiencing while engaged in the activity or performance; is not easily distracted.

Measurement Examples:
- Interview a new employee.
- Shadow a new employee to determine if they understand the interactions between the information resources they chose to answer a question. Provide guidance/feedback using a standard set of examples or based on the interactions observed.
- Ask employees open-ended questions such as "what would you do if ...something...." Then interview then about a similar actual experience and their ability to resolve it.
- Observe staff member Work with a patron on research issue and identify materials in response to a request

Intermediate Level: An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward refining his/her ability to think and learn more effectively and to remember more details; in addition the employee should now be able to use a range of tools to help him/her think more creatively; and should have refined his/her ability to focus fully on the array of information items s/he will need to complete a job. The employee should now be comfortable with complexity, ambiguity and explaining their thinking to others.

Measurement Examples:
- Conduct a direct observation of the employee in a variety of settings doing??? Critique his/her performance and share the results.
- Prepare a skills inventory related to the competency, share it with the employee, rate him/her in a variety of situations, and follow up with suggestions for change.

Advanced Level: An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward being more creative and original in their thought or expression; they should now to able to demonstrate divergent thinking
skills or thinking that extends in many directions from a single point (i.e. coming up with many possible solutions to a single problem)

**Measurement Examples:**
- Observe the employee as they attempt to analyze a problem. Ask them to describe the “solution paths” they thought of.
- Create a checklist of divergent thinking skills and rate the employee as s/he attempts to help a patron answer a question. Provide feedback on his/her performance.

**Problem Solving**—Anticipates problems, determines the nature of problems by asking appropriate questions, invites ideas, reviews documentation, determines probable causes, and implements solutions.

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

**Beginning Level:** A Beginning employee should

**Measurement Examples:**
- Interview a patron about his/her interaction with the employee.
- Observe an employee/patron interaction. Ask the patron a series of leading questions afterwards. Provide feedback to the employee based on the interactions discussed with the patron.

**Intermediate Level:** An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward

**Measurement Examples:**
- Conduct a direct observation of the employee in a variety of settings doing... Critique his/her performance and share the results.
- Prepare a skills inventory related to the competency, share it with the employee, rate him/her in a variety of situations, and follow up with suggestions for change.

**Advanced Level:** An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward

**Measurement Examples:**
- Observe the employee
- Provide feedback on his/her performance.

**Attention to Detail**—Ability to review details quickly; keep accurate records; produce error-free work

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

**Beginning Level:** A Beginning employee should

**Measurement Examples:**
- Interview a new employee
- Provide feedback using a standard set of examples or based on the interactions observed.
- Create a checklist...
Intermediate Level: An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward

Measurement Examples:
- Conduct a direct observation of the employee in a variety of settings doing???
- Critique his/her performance and share the results.
- Prepare a skills inventory related to the competency, share it with the employee, rate him/her in a variety of situations, and follow up with suggestions for change.

Advanced Level: An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward

Measurement Examples:
- Observe the employee
- Provide feedback on his/her performance.

Leadership

Credibility -- Keeps promises; honors commitments; accepts responsibility for mistakes; honest and truthful when communicating information; behaves consistently with espoused values.

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

Beginning Level: A Beginning employee should demonstrate their ability to keep their word, accept responsibility for mistakes when questioned, and strive to effectively and honestly communicate information.

Measurement Examples:
- Locate an error or mistake in judgment made by the employee and ask about the circumstances.
- Observe the employee interact with patrons and verify the accuracy of the information conveyed.

Intermediate Level: An Intermediate employee should be willing to admit mistakes before being asked, honor all commitments and promises for themselves and the department, and behave in an honorable fashion.

Measurement Examples:
- For one month track all promises/commitments made by employee and note if and when the commitment was honored.
- Observe employee with other workers and patrons to determine if they are living up to the values and goals set by the institution for employees.

Advanced Level: An Advanced employee should be actively willing to admit mistakes and should set and follow high level values as examples for others to follow.

Measurement Examples:
- Ask the employee to develop a code of ethics for the library.
- Observe how other employees view the behavior and ethics of the employee.

Negotiation—Compromises and reaches acceptable solutions without alienating others in the process; can influence others both within and outside the institution; persuasively presents thoughts and ideas; can make appropriate trade-offs; wins concessions without damaging
relationships; and influences, motivates and persuades others in order to achieve institutional and departmental objectives

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

**Beginning Level:** A Beginning employee should be able to participate in a meeting or planning process and offer views.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Place the employee on a team charged with accomplishing a specific task and observe how the employee interacts with others.

**Intermediate Level:** An Intermediate employee should be able to work closely with peers and direct superiors and be able to work towards reaching mutually acceptable goals. Should have a basic understanding of the institutions goals and how they might be achieved.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Place the employee on an interdepartmental team to determine how well they are able to negotiate with other employees at various levels of responsibly and observe how will they represent the department.

**Advanced Level:** An Advanced employee should be able to negotiate with vendors and employees both within the organization and outside the institution. The employee should be able to accurately represent the views of the institution to people at all levels and should be able to promote the views of the institution effectively.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Observe the employee in a negotiation with a vendor.
- Observe the employee negotiate with superiors in the institution for funding or other library needs.

**Vision—Conceptualizes what tools are needed by the library in order to effectively implement programs**

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

**Beginning Level:** A Beginning employee understands the overall goals of the library and knows what basic resources are needed to achieve these goals.

**Measurement Examples:**
- 

**Intermediate Level:** An Intermediate employee actively employs tools to further the mission of the library.

**Measurement Examples:**
- 

**Advanced Level:** An Advanced employee seeks out new tools and methods for improving the long-range functionality of the library.

**Measurement Examples:**
- 

Communication Skills

Oral Communication – Speaks to clients and others clearly, professionally and tactfully; explains complicated issues and procedures simply and accurately; identifies user level of knowledge and provides understandable information; translates technical terms into understandable terms.

Indicators of growth should include the following:

Beginning Level: The Beginning Employee should demonstrate good oral communication skills in order to work effectively with colleagues, supervisors, patrons and outside agents in problem solving, cooperative projects and responding to requests for information. In doing so, the Beginning Librarian should give clear instructions, explain technical terms clearly, ask clarifying questions if necessary and be able to give accurate and straightforward responses to questions asked by others.

Measurement Devices:
- Observe the new employee and evaluate employee’s oral interaction in work situations, e.g., answering a patron’s question, sharing information at staff meetings, responding to and asking questions of others and during one-on-one conferences with the employee.
- Obtain feedback from employee’s peers about the employee’s ability to explain technical concepts and procedures.
- Videotape the employee giving presentations at forums such as a class or a training session for other employees.

Intermediate and Advanced Levels: An Intermediate and Advanced level librarian should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward communicating with a broad range of internal and external audiences to communicate the library’s principles, policies and procedures. In oral presentations to staff, governing bodies and external groups, the librarian should identify the audience’s level of knowledge and be able to articulate complicated issues simply and accurately.

Measurement Examples:
- Interview those trained by employee to determine that the oral instructions were clear and were geared to match trainee’s level of experience.
- Videotape employee’s presentations to classes, at professional conferences and to external agents.
- Conduct a direct observation of the employee’s verbal interaction with subordinates, peers and supervisors. Provide feedback and discuss with the employee.

Writing Skills: Expresses ideas clearly and concisely in all written work.

Indicators of growth should include the following indicators

Beginning Level: At the beginning level the new employee should demonstrate good writing skills characterized by clarity, accuracy, and correct grammar, spelling, and punctuation.

Measurement Examples:
- Review employee’s written communication carried out in the course of his/her job responsibilities, including memos to fellow staff and reports to supervisors. Provide feedback and discuss with the employee.
• Have employee write periodic reports and share them with you for discussion.

**Intermediate and Advanced Levels:** At Intermediate and Advanced levels, the employee should demonstrate the basic writing skills of the Beginning level and be moving toward the ability to provide clearly-written communication on complex issues for both internal and external groups, including library staff, patrons, the library’s governing body, colleagues at regional and national levels and the public. The intermediate and advanced level employee should be able to write in a clear and concise style that is appropriate for the intended audience, whether the document is a proposal, budget information, scholarly research, performance evaluation, news article or report.

**Measurement Examples:**

• Review documents prepared by the employee, provide feedback and discuss them with the employee.
• Solicit feedback from outsiders.

**Listening Skills:** Recognizes feelings, concerns and underlying messages of others; identifies important information in oral transactions, pays attention to orally presented facts and details.

Indicators of growth should include the following.

**Beginning Level:** At the Beginning level the employee should listen to peers, supervisors and external agents by giving full attention to their questions, instructions and information. The Beginning Level Employee should maintain eye contact and employ body language, such as facing the speaker, which demonstrates the employee is listening. The Beginning Level Employee is able to discern emotional cues that may underlie what the speaker is saying.

**Measurement Examples:**

• Have routine one-on-one meetings with the employee to discuss standards of performance and follow through with a review of the work product in order to determine whether employee was listening to supervisor’s instructions.
• Perform routine direct observation as employee works with peers, observing whether employee accepts and welcomes information from others.

**Intermediate and Advanced Levels:** At the Intermediate and Advanced levels, the librarian should demonstrate basic listening skills of the Beginning level and should be moving toward the ability to identify and understand complex information conveyed by internal and external groups.

**Measurement Examples:**

• **Sociability:** Desires and values interactions with others; relates to a wide variety of people; works effectively with others to accomplish goals.

  Indicators of growth should include the following:

**Beginning Level:** The beginning librarian should value and demonstrate the ability to interact and associate with peers, supervisors and external agents, on a one-to-one basis and as part of a group, in order to collaborate on projects and work in carrying out the library’s mission. This includes being open to casual and task-oriented discussions, the exchange of ideas, planning with others and taking direction from supervisors.
Measurement Examples:
- Make direct observation of employee’s performance in working on a project.
- Solicit feedback from peers who participate in the project with the employee.
- Perform routine spot checks as the new employee interacts with staff.

Intermediate and Advanced Levels: At Intermediate and Advanced levels, librarians should have mastered all of the Beginning Indicators and be moving toward the promotion of group cohesion and successful collaboration among staff. Intermediate and Advanced level librarians should be able to work cooperatively with internal and external groups in negotiation, problem solving, teaching, marketing the library’s services and lobbying for issues that promote the interests of libraries and librarians. Successful Intermediate and Advanced level employees demonstrate an understanding of the institution’s political environment and can thereby work effectively with governing bodies and outside agents to promote the library and advocate for its needs.

Measurement Examples:
- Observe employee’s effectiveness in working with subordinates to promote team efforts, determining whether the employee establishes clear performance standards for cooperation and (cooperative efforts?)
- Solicit feedback from employee’s administrative peers.
- Solicit feedback from officials who have interacted with the employee or served on the same committee.
- Make direct observation of employee’s ability to work in cooperation with outside agents, such as governing officials, political representatives and the public.

Professional Perspective

Understanding People--Perceives and responds to behavioral cues; has insight into the reasons underlying the behavior and actions of others; can analyze the motives and feelings of colleagues, clients, and others

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

Beginning Level: A Beginning employee should demonstrate his/her unique understanding of methods and processes for working effectively with others. They are attentive to emotional cues, listen well, and recognize that prior judgments may be incorrect.

Measurement Examples:
- Interview a new employee to determine their ability to listen well. Provide feedback using a checklist of items they should have spotted during the interview.
- Shadow a new employee to determine the methods and processes they use to interact with others. Provide feedback using a standard set of examples or based on the interactions observed.
- Create a Customer Feedback Survey that can be administered shortly after an interaction with a beginning employee that measures mastery of emotional cues and keys in on judgment and insightfulness of the employee. Provide feedback and discuss with the employee.

Intermediate Level: An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward identifying and demonstrating an understanding of and
sensitivity toward the mindsets, values, and cultural differences of others with whom they work and interact. Is forthright when an error in judgment exists.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Conduct a direct observation of the employee in a variety of settings with people of different mindsets, values, and cultural differences. Critique his/her performance and share the results.
- Prepare a skills inventory related to the competency, share it with the employee, rate him/her in a variety of situations, and follow up with suggestions for change.

**Advanced Level:** An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward synthesizing and summarizing relevant points from ambiguous discussions. Knows when to appropriately question a process or plan to aid in understanding a unique perspective. Challenges bias and intolerance.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Observe the employee as they attempt to institute some type of change process in the institution.
- Create and then video tape a performance-based simulation of the employee with another person in a race-based, sex-based, or other highly charged situation. Provide feedback on his/her performance.

**Teamwork**—Ability to work effectively with other groups in order to further the common goals of the team and the institution.

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

**Beginning Level:** A Beginning employee should demonstrate the ability to use a group’s core values in making decisions and clarifying choices.

**Measurement Examples:**
- As a group, create a set of “team” ground rules and guidelines. Share them with all group members. Have members individually critique the other members of the group on behavior associated with the ground rules and share that information with the team leader and employee supervisors. Provide individual feedback.
- Videotape a “team” meeting. Have supervisors meet with the team as a group to provide feedback about the decision-making processes that took place.

**Intermediate Level:** An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward identifying and demonstrating an understanding of the mind sets, values, cultural differences, and roles of group members (group dynamics); readily make sacrifices to meet a larger organizational goal; and find a sense of purpose in the larger mission.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Have the employee create a portfolio of examples s/he has used in working with diverse groups of people. Critique the portfolio.
- Have the employee create a self-assessment of instances in which s/he has been involved that exemplify making sacrifices to meet a larger organizational goal. Critique the self-assessment.

**Advanced Level:** An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward actively seeking out opportunities to fulfill a group’s mission. Additionally the Advanced employee should be able to
read a group's emotional currents and power relationships and work towards keeping the group on-track and on-task in spite of or because of those relationships.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Obtain feedback from team members about the employee's ability to keep a group on-track. Discuss with the employee.
- Have the employee prepare a self-report about his/her ability to read a team's emotional currents and power relationships and how s/he conducted him/herself during the meeting.

**Community Perspective**—Understands the role the library plays within the larger community; recognizes the importance of other departments and works to achieve the best solution for the entire institution.

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

**Beginning Level:** A Beginning employee should demonstrate his ability to align his/her goals with the goals of the group or organization within which s/he has a specific role.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Create a role play with the employee in which his/her goals conflict with the organization. Have an outsider critique the role play.

**Intermediate Level:** An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward finding a sense of purpose in the organization's larger mission.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Have the employee self-report on his/her role and purpose in the larger organization. Provide feedback on the report.

**Advanced Level:** An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward using the organization's values in making decisions and clarifying choices for others in the organization. Additionally, they should actively seek out opportunities to fulfill the organization's mission and goals.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Have employees from other parts of the organization observe and report on the employee's ability to use the organization's values in making decisions and clarify choices for others.

**Reliability/Trustworthiness**—Behaves consistently and predictably; is dependable, able to gain trust by being honest; works with integrity; and meets commitments.

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

**Beginning Level:** A Beginning employee should exhibit his/her ability to build trust by demonstrating reliability and authenticity in cultivating good relationships and creating good work products.
Measurement Examples:

- After an employee has been assigned a difficult task, obtain written feedback from those with whom s/he has worked about his/her success in cultivating a relationship and a critique on the usefulness of the work product itself. Share the feedback with the employee.
- Evaluate the output and products of the employee's work and share your findings with him/her.

**Intermediate Level:** An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward demonstrating how s/he balances the accuracy and value of information received from others, by meeting commitments and keeping promises, and by holding him/herself personally accountable for meeting objectives.

Measurement Examples:

- Have the employee share his/her goals for accomplishing his/her part of a major project with you. Evaluate his/her goals in light of other time pressures and commitments. Readjust his/her time line to help him/her meet project goals.

**Advanced Level:** An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward admitting their own mistakes, confronting unprincipled actions in others, and taking tough principled stands even if they are unpopular.

Measurement Examples:

- Ask someone considered to be an expert evaluator in your organization to critique the employee in a situation in which s/he has to admit they are wrong or in which they confront another about his/her actions.

**Empathy—Understands and displays sensitivity to others needs and concerns; minimizes anxiety and frustration**

Indicators of Growth in this area could include the following:

**Beginning Level:** A Beginning employee should build good working relationships with peers and management by listening to and following advice of managers, coordinating with and offering to help peers whenever practical, and by interacting at meetings by asking clarifying questions. Additionally, the Beginning employee should demonstrate sensitivity and respect for differences in individual perspective, personality, work style, and ethnic/cultural values (i.e., values diversity) in meetings and in one on one interactions.

Measurement Examples:

- Observe the employee during a meeting. See if s/he had questions following the meeting. Discuss techniques s/he used or could have used to help clarify information.
- Perform brief check-ins with the employee after observing him interacting with other employees, managers, or outsiders. Evaluate his/her sensitivity, ability to deal with differences in perspective, and ability to deal with different personality types.

**Intermediate Level:** An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward setting systems in place that permit her to acknowledge others' unique skills and distinct contributions to business success and to learn from them. Additionally, at the Intermediate level the employee be aware of and sense the developmental needs of other employees and help to bolster their abilities.
Measurement Examples:
- Critique the employee on his/her ability to evaluate the skills of another employee who works outside his department or area.

Advanced Level: An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward developing and maintaining positive, high personal visibility and credibility with top management, board committees, and community leaders. Additionally, the Advanced employee recognizes possible relationship problems and issues and formulates appropriate, timely resolutions without hesitation.

Measurement Examples:
- 

Tactfulness—Respectfully responds to information requests; handles colleagues, clients, and others in one-on-one and group meetings with poise and diplomacy; respects the ideas and input of others; and respectfully suggests or implements divergent solutions

Beginning Level: A Beginning employee should share appropriate information with the right people in a polite and timely manner regardless of the circumstances in which information requests are made.

Measurement Examples:
- Create a checklist of appropriate behaviors with the employee. Observe his/her behavior in a variety of interactions. Critique his/her performance based on the factors on the checklist.
- Obtain feedback from colleagues, clients and others about his/her poise and diplomacy in handling their requests.

Intermediate Level: An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward politely but appropriately shifting attention and refocusing on new tasks/goals when complex, competing work demands call for it.

Measurement Examples:
- 

Advanced Level: An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward maintaining awareness of and effectively using the time and talents of others in the organization who may be more qualified to answer a question or implement a solution.

Measurement Examples:
- 

Ethics—Exhibits high professional and personal standards, treats people fairly and with respect, is honest in all communications; refrains from being manipulative or obscuring facts

Beginning Level: A Beginning employee should exercise unyielding integrity in all business transactions; will not compromise library values to achieve short-term objectives. Demonstrates personal integrity by providing an accurate and straightforward interpretation of data.
Demonstrates understanding of and appreciates professional ethics, and applies them in day-to-day business activities.

**Measurement Examples:**

- 

**Intermediate Level:** An Intermediate employee should have mastered all of the Beginning indicators and be moving toward building trust with key personnel at all levels of the organization by consistently demonstrating direct, honest behavior. Demonstrates an in-depth understanding of more complex and judgmental areas/issues. Identifies ethical issues and discusses them in a constructive manner.

**Measurement Examples:**

- 

**Advanced Level:** An Advanced employee should have mastered all of the beginning indicators and most, if not all of the Intermediate indicators and work toward applying judgment and counseling personnel on appropriate behavior in gray (undefined) or highly judgmental areas. Sets the tone for ethical behavior. Will not tolerate a compromise of ethics in others; serves as an example to others.

**Measurement Examples:**

- 

**Personal Attributes/Qualities**

**Accountability:** Maintains motivation when faced with challenges; takes initiative beyond routine responsibilities; meets deadlines; accepts responsibility for mistakes.

Indicators of growth should include the following:

**Beginning Level:** At the Beginning level the new librarian will take responsibility for own personal and professional actions, results, risks or mistakes which contribute or detract from overall goals and objectives of the library.

**Measurement Examples:**

- Collection and analysis of monthly statistical reports on work output (e.g. reference, cataloging, acquisitions)
- Observed compliance with work schedules and policies meeting attendance, deadline compliance
- Quality review of documented reference, research, cataloging activity for designated periods of time
- Observed willingness/resistance to take ownership of work, products, services and results

**Intermediate and Advanced Levels:** Librarian will have mastered all beginning level indicators and have moved on to monitoring others programs/or activities and will take corrective actions when called for. Assures that effective organizational level status and control mechanisms are developed and maintained to assure performance of library services. Encourages others to take ownership of work products and services and identifies how program results are to be measured.
Measurement Examples:
- Observation during unit staff meetings
- Analysis of statistical reporting of work performed
- Periodic focus interviews with co-workers, customers, incumbent
- Observable quality of performance appraisal assessments of subordinates conducted by incumbent

Adaptability/Flexibility: Responsive to changes in the library organization and to the work styles of others; maintains focus on a task or project in the face of numerous interruptions; when interrupted, judges how to proceed.

Indicators of growth should include the following:

Beginning Level: At the Beginning level the novice librarian exhibits the ability to quickly adapt to change, handle some multiple demands simultaneously and accommodate new situations and realities. The successful employee works well with all levels and types of people (internal & external), welcomes divergent ideas, and maximizes limited resources.

Measurement Examples:
- In observable situations (staff meetings, self-evaluation reviews, on the job performance), interaction with employee’s peers and customers ascertains whether incumbent is willing to learn new procedures and technology, is open to ideas different from one’s own and looks for better alternatives to accomplishing required tasks.
- Observe employee’s enthusiasm or reluctance to adapt to new automated software applications by monitoring productivity reports on a new serials check-in system. How long does it take to become proficient in new technology?

Intermediate Level: At the Intermediate level the librarian incorporated the basic competency, and in addition, may adapt a supervisory style to individual needs of employee subordinates. Handles with increasing frequency multiple projects and duties simultaneously and prioritized as needed. Respects and deals effectively with others fears of change and exhibits the ability to continue a course of action despite setbacks.

Measurement Examples:
- Monitors more closely the satisfactory completion and follow through of work projects that have been delayed for any number of reasons.
- Observes and interviews co-workers relative to effectiveness of incumbent’s sensitivity to providing instruction/training for new programs/procedures used by subordinates.
- Observes performance closely in high pressure situations by consulting with co-workers and customers.

Advanced Level: At the advanced level incumbent brings with them competencies in basic and intermediate levels and in addition exhibits leadership/management skills to newly assigned positions and duties – responds to increase or downsizing in staff or increases in workload by involving other librarians in restructuring work and stays abreast of and educates staff about changing trends in the law library community.

Measurement Examples:
- Review of quality of presentations made at professional associations and writing completed for publication about the changing library profession.
Monitor level of success in winning funding necessary to accommodate the ever-changing law library scene.

**Client Focus:** Demonstrates a concern for the needs and expectations of clients and makes them a high priority; maintains contact with clients; understands client needs and makes them the focus of organizational decision making and action.

Indicators of growth should include the following.

**Beginning Level:** At the Beginning core level the new librarian recognizes that making customers and their needs the primary focus of the institution's actions. Developing and sustaining productive customer (internal & external) relationships is key to the library's healthy longevity. Key actions inherent in even the beginner's repertoire, are to seek to understand the client, educate them, build collaborative relationships, taking actions to meet their needs and concerns, and set up customer feedback systems.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Results of user surveys.
- Critical review of relevance of customer oriented website.
- Review of answered email reference inquiries.
- Statistics showing increased/decreased use of library services and collection.
- Periodic use of testing of reference/other staff.

**Intermediate and Advanced Levels:** At the Intermediate and Advanced levels the librarian carries forward the beginning competencies and in addition provides leadership and management level qualities demonstrating enhanced client focus factors including (1.) recognizing fellow employees who excel at good customer service and empower them to resolve problems independently, (2.) actual design of processes and procedures that are customer-friendly, (3.) develop mechanisms for continuing client feedback, (4.) bases strategic planning on customer feedback & establishes a client-oriented culture in the library & promotes hiring of librarians who espouse that culture.

**Measurement Examples:**
- Monitor frequency of award/recognition ceremonies for good client service.
- Observe and evaluate various customer feedback survey mechanisms designed by incumbent.
- Track success at recruiting / hiring client focused library staff.
- Observe accessibility and visibility of librarian to all customers, including co-workers.
- Gauge success rate at eliminating barriers (irritants) to customer oriented library services.

**Persistence:** Can see problems or issues through to completion; overcomes organizational or structural barriers.

Indicators of growth should include the following:

**Beginning Level:** At the beginning level the new librarian should know when to follow directions, question plans or seek help. Should exhibit patience, eagerness to learn, and be reliable and dependable when seeing projects through to completion.
Measurement Examples:
- Observe the employee and evaluate employee’s ability to complete a given assignment, e.g. how well the employee follows direction, how many questions are asked, the appropriateness of the questions, and feedback offered by the employee.
- Obtain feedback from employee’s peers and clients about the employee’s ability to see assignments through to completion.

Intermediate and Advanced Levels: At Intermediate and Advanced levels, librarians should have mastered all of the Beginning Indicators and be moving toward establishing goals and developing strategies for achieving their goals. At the advanced level, librarians should be moving toward creating an environment that encourages establishing and meeting specific goals. They should be stable and reliable team members and decisive and unwavering in their ability to see projects through to completion and be determined and display continuous effort no matter what the task.

Measurement Examples:
- Observe the employee and evaluate employee’s ability to accomplish goals and develop strategies independently, e.g. how often is direction required, do strategies demonstrate good judgment and efficacy, what obstacles had to be overcome.
- Observe those reporting to the librarian to determine if persistence is a value encouraged in the librarian’s unit.

Enthusiasm: Eagerness and willingness to promote a library-related interest or cause. Often illustrated by actively and energetically promoting and advocating for the library profession, the institution, and others. Displays an exuberant, inspirational, or passionate viewpoint about the interest or cause at issue and is an excited and focused advocate.

Indicators of growth should include the following:

Beginning Level: At the beginning level, the new librarian understands the vision and culture of librarianship.

Measurement Examples:
- Observe the librarian’s interaction with other librarians and library clients to determine the level of professional understanding.
- Membership in at least one professional association

Intermediate: At Intermediate level, librarians should have mastered all of the Beginning Indicators and be moving toward full awareness of the trends of librarianship and developing others’ understanding of the profession.

Measurement Examples:
- Active membership in at least one professional association
- Writing for professional journals or presentations to librarians

Advanced: At Advanced level, librarians should have mastered all of the Beginning and Intermediate Indicators and be moving toward understanding of the legal and legislative environment and the impact on library trends and values. Librarians should also be moving toward influencing their environment.
Measurement Examples:
- Leadership position in a professional association
- Mentoring beginning librarians

Self-Management: Ability to maintain motivation and work independently for extended periods of time with minimal support and approval; takes initiative

Indicators of growth should include the following:

Beginning Level: At the Beginning level, new librarians should demonstrate strong work ethic in getting things done well and on time with high-quality output.

Measurement Examples:
- Observe the librarian to determine how the librarian approaches work, e.g. does the librarian step forward to take assignments, is the work product thorough, is work completed on time without urging.
- Interview peers to determine if the librarian assumes a fair proportion of assignments and a fair proportion of joint assignments.

Intermediate and Advanced: At the Intermediate and Advanced levels, librarians should have mastered all of the Beginning Indicators and be moving toward performing at a consistently high level in a setting of changing priorities and demands, constantly striving to exceed previous accomplishments and client goals. At the advanced level, librarians should create an environment that encourages independence and initiative, sets an example for others to follow.

Measurement Examples:
- Observe the librarian to determine how often the librarian requires direction, management or urging from supervisors.
- Obtain feedback from peers, subordinates and library clients to determine the consistency of high level output
- Observe the work ethic of the librarian's direct reports
DEFINITIONS

The following definitions were used for the terms below:

Advanced: Describes the level at which someone with mastery of a skill should be performing. Often this person is the highest ranking law librarian in the organization. However, it may also describe a department head with specialized knowledge in a subject area. Additionally, because some competencies are so complex, they can only be performed by a senior law library staff member.

Basic: Describes the level at which someone new to a skill or attribute should be performing. Often this law librarian will occupy an entry-level position in the organization. However, it may also describe a seasoned professional with limited exposure to this performance area.

Competencies:

Competency Areas:

Functional Expertise:

Intermediate: Describes the level at which someone with detailed knowledge in an area should be performing. It is expected that this employee is capable of taking operational responsibility for an area. Often, this employee occupies a mid-level position within the organization and has supervisory responsibilities.

Leadership Qualities:

Measurement Devices:

Personal Attributes/Qualities:

Proficiency Levels:

Professional Perspective:

Skills:

SUMMARY OF SURVEY RESULTS

LAW LIBRARIAN COMPETENCIES AND ROLES MATRIX

CONCLUSION